

**STUDENTS' ERRORS IN TRANSLATING NARRATIVE TEXT  
BASED ON DULAY'S SURFACE STRATEGY TAXONOMY**

**AN ARTICLE**

**Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements  
for the Degree of Sarjana Pendidikan**

**By**

**DWI HANDAYANI**

**Registration Number: 2122121016**



**ENGLISH AND LITERATURE DEPARTMENT  
FACULTY OF LANGUAGES AND ARTS  
STATE UNIVERSITY OF MEDAN  
2018**

**JURNAL**

**PENERAPAN METODE *DRILL* TERHADAP PENGUASAAN  
PEMBELAJARAN TARI SERAMPANG XII DALAM  
KEGIATAN EKSTRAKURIKULER  
DI SMA NEGERI 3 MEDAN**

Oleh:

**DINI WUTSQA AMALIA  
NIM. 2123140013**

**Telah Diverifikasi Dan Dinyatakan Memenuhi Syarat  
Untuk Diunggah Pada Jurnal Online**

Medan, Januari 2018

Menyetujui,

**Dosen Pembimbing I**



**Dr. Tuti Rahayu, Dra, M.Si**  
NIP. 19661201 199303 2 002

**Dosen Pembimbing II**



**Iskandar Muda, S.Sn, M.Sn**  
NIP. 19671220 200312 1 002

**Ketua Program Studi Pendidikan Tari  
Jurusan Sendratasik  
FBS-UNIMED**



**Siti Rahmah, S.Pd., M.Si**  
NIP. 19690928 19990 3 2002

# **STUDENTS' ERRORS IN TRANSLATING NARRATIVE TEXT BASED ON DULAY'S SURFACE STRATEGY TAXONOMY**

\*Dwi Handayani

\*\*Anni Holila Pulungan

\*\*Fahri Haswani

## **ABSTRACT**

This study is purposed to find out the errors in translating narrative text based on Dulay's Surface Strategy taxonomy. In addition, this study is also aimed to describe the possible causes of those errors. This study applied the descriptive qualitative research which the data were obtained from the translation texts that were written by the second- year students of SMA Tunas Pelita Binjai. The data were collected by using the students' translation text. Then the data were analyzed by identifying the errors, describing the errors, and the last explaining the errors. The errors that occurred in students' translation texts are omission error, addition error, misformation error, and misordering error. The result of the research indicates that the students made 230 errors which classified into: 22,61% omission error, 11,30% addition error, 65,22% misformation error, and 0,87% misordering error. The most dominant error that occurred in the students' translation text is misformation errors and the causes of errors were influenced by the interlingual transfer and intralingual transfer.

**Keywords:** *Error Analysis, Dulay's Surface Strategy Taxonomy, Causes of Errors.*

---

\*Graduate

\*\*Lecturer

## **INTRODUCTION**

### *Background of the Study*

Translation is the process of communication. Levy (2000) states that translation is a process of communication: the objective translating is to import the knowledge of the original to the foreign reader. As a process of communication, translation functions as the medium across the linguistic and cultural barriers in conveying the messages written in the foreign language (Duff, 1989). Translation has an important role as a way to communicate; translation also has a function as the way to share the message, information, stories, experiences and most of all knowledge.

Hatim and Munday (2004) define translation as the process of transferring meaning a written text from source language (SL) to target language (TL). Translation is not only concerned on changing words from one language to another, but also mastery of both the source language and the target language. In Indonesia, English is a foreign language that students must learn in school, and translation helps students getting knowledge from the source language.

The students especially students in Senior High School level must deal with many kinds of texts; one of them is narrative text. Narrative text or narration is any written English text in which the writer wants to deal with actual or vicarious experience in different ways (Siahaan and Shinoda, 2008). They state that the purpose of narrative text is to entertain, to tell a story or to provide literary experience. Narrative text is a text about story that can be in the form of folklore,

animal story (fable), legend or short story, novels, etc. Yudiantoro (1996) states that narrative text is story which can be fable style, myth, and legend.

While translating a text, the students often do errors, they may overlook the important things in translating a text such as the accuracy, natural, and communicative so that the meaning can be understood by the reader.

The term 'error' usually means that something is wrong. Translation 'errors' occur because something has gone wrong during the transfer and movement from the SL to the TL (Hansen, 2009).

Crystal (2008) states that Errors are assumed to reflect, in a systematic way, the level of competence achieved by a learner; they are contrasted with 'mistakes' which are performance limitations that a learner would be able to correct. The students sometimes make errors while translating a text by omitting one or more words, adding an item or more in utterance, using the wrong form of morpheme or structure and misplacing morpheme in sentence, so the meaning of utterance will be changed. These kinds of errors can be analyzed and classified by using Surface Strategy Taxonomy by Dulay.

Based on preliminary observation that had been done by the researcher at SMK Negeri 1 Stabat, the researcher found errors in students' translation text. The students cannot form a good target text repeatedly so the readers cannot get the meaning of the text. The students are not able to convey the meaning of the text to the readers. This phenomenon becomes the reason for the researcher to analyze the translation errors made by the students. The researcher is interested in conducting this research related to errors in students' translation text based on

Dulay's Surface Strategy Taxonomy. The researcher will also find out the causes of the errors so the students will be aware of making errors in their translation.

## **REVIEW OF LITERATURE**

### **1. Mistake and Error**

Gass & Selinker (2008) state that mistake is generally one-time-only events, and the learner who makes a mistake can recognize it as a mistake. Therefore, an error is systematic, and it is likely to occur repeatedly and it is not recognized by the learner as an error (Gass & Selinker, 2008).

Dulay, Burt, & Krashen (1982), define the description of an error refers to the product of language acquisition, whereas the explanation of an error- the determination of its origins- refers to the language of acquisition process. Brown (2000) also defines an error is a noticeable deviation from the adult grammar of a native speaker. It reflects an incompetence of the learner's language use.

#### **a. Error Analysis**

Brown (2002) states that error analysis is the process of observing, analyzing and classifying the deviation of the rules of the second language and then to reveal the systems operated by learners. Error analysis is also the type of linguistics that focuses on the errors made by the learners (Khansir, 2012). By doing error analysis, the errors that the learners can be seen and classified based on the types of errors.

## **b. Types of Error**

Dulay et al. (1982) explain that there are some descriptive classifications of error, namely Linguistic Category, Surface Structure Taxonomy, Comparative Analysis and Communicative Effect taxonomy.

### 1). Surface Strategy Taxonomy

A surface strategy taxonomy highlights the way surface structures are altered learners may omit necessary items or add unnecessary ones; they may *mis-form* items or *mis-order* them. Many researchers have noticed, however that the surface elements of a language are altered in specific and systematic ways. It shows the cognitive process that underlined the learner's reconstruction of the language learned. It also makes aware that learners' errors are some logic. They are types of this category, they are:

#### a). Omission

The omission errors are characterized by the absence of an item that must appear in well- formed utterance and the content of morphemes (nominal, verbs, adjectives, adverbs) which should be in the correctly expressions. Omission error happens because the students sometimes omit the utterance that is actually important. Then the meaning of utterance automatically will change.

Dulay et al. (1982) explain that there are two types of omission errors; they can be described as follows:

#### 1). Omission of the Content Morphemes

Omission of the content morphemes is the omission of morphemes that carry much meaning of a sentence, for examples are nouns, verbs, adjectives and adverbs.

## 2). Omission of Grammatical Morphemes

Omission of grammatical morphemes is omitting the morpheme that does not carry much meaning. In other words, it plays a minor role in conveying the sentence meaning. This type includes inflections in verbs and nouns (the –s in bags and chairs, the –ed in watched and lived, the –ing in looking and buying), the preposition (in, on, at, under, etc.), conjunction (and, or, but, because, etc.), verb auxiliaries (to be, will, must, etc.), and the article (a, an, the).

## b). Addition

Addition errors are characterized by the presence of an item that must not appear in a well- formed utterance. Addition error happens when the translator adds an item or more in utterance.

## c). Misformation

Misformation errors are characterized by the use of the wrong form of the morpheme or structure. Misformation error happens if the translator uses the wrong form of morpheme or structure.

#### d). Misordering

Misordering errors are characterized by the incorrect placement of a morpheme or group of morphemes in an utterance. The students often do misaddressing on the group of morphemes. Misordering error happens because of misplace of morpheme in sentence. Translator does wrong in the process placement of morpheme in utterance.

#### 2). Linguistic Category

This linguistic category taxonomy classifies errors in respect to language component the errors affects. Language component include phonology (pronunciation), syntax and morphology (grammar), semantic and lexicon (meaning and vocabulary), and discourse (style). Many researchers use the linguistic category taxonomy as a reporting tool, which organizes the errors they have collected.

#### 3). Comparative Taxonomy

The classification of errors in comparative taxonomy is based on comparison between the students of target language (L2) errors certain other types of construction. In this study, the errors made by the children learning the target language as their first language and equivalent phrases or sentences in the learners' mother tongue ( Indonesia language ).

#### 4). Communicative Effect Taxonomy

This taxonomy is different from both surface strategy and comparative taxonomies. Communicative effect taxonomy deals with errors from the perspective of their effect on the listener or reader.

### **c. Morphology**

Morphology refers to the mental system involved in word formation or to the branch of linguistics that deals with words, their internal structure, and how they are formed. Word, in this case is seen as the compact unity of form and meaning which shows syntactical valence aspect; that is the possibilities which is owned by word to combine with other words in words class (Uhlenbeck, 1982).

#### 1. Words

As explained above, word is the result of morphological process. Word is defined as a freestanding unit of meaning. It can stand alone and has meaning even though with or without bound morpheme.

#### 2. Morphemes

Morpheme is defined as the smallest unit in language utterances which has meaning. Ramlan (1995) states that morpheme is the smallest element which cannot be divided into any other forms.

## **2. Translation and Translating**

Shuttleworth and Cowie (1997) say “Translation is an incredibly broad notion which can be understood in many different ways. For example, one may talk of translation as a process or a product, and identify such sub- types as

literary translation, technical translation, subtitling and machine translation; moreover, while more typically it just refers to the transfer of written texts, the term sometimes includes interpreting.”

### **3. Narrative text**

Narrative text is a piece of text which tells a story and in doing so entertains and informs the reader or listener. The following are the social function, generic structure, and lexical grammatical features (Anderson and Anderson, 2003).

## **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

This research is conducted by using qualitative research, the researcher collects and analyzes the data, then draws conclusion based on the data analysis. Auerbach and Silverstein (2003) state that, “Qualitative research is research that involves analyzing and interpreting texts and interviews in order to discover meaningful patterns descriptive of a particular phenomenon”

The data of this research were errors that found in students’ translation text. The source of data in this research was the second- year students of SMA Tunas Pelita Binjai in academic year 2017/2018. The second- year students consist of three classes with the total numbers of students were 90 students and each class consists of 30 students, and the researcher took the data from two classes, so there were 60 students who took part in this research.

The analysis of students’ translation test involves the identification and classification the errors. Therefore, it goes to several steps:

1. Collecting the data

2. Identifying the errors from the students' translation text
3. Classifying errors
4. Describing errors based on their types
5. Analyzing the students' errors

## **DATA ANALYSIS AND RESEARCH FINDINGS**

### *Data Analysis*

The analysis result shows that the second- year students of SMA Tunas Pelita Binjai produced 230 errors in translating narrative text. Based on Dulay's Surface Strategy Taxonomy, the errors were classified into four types; omission, addition, misformation and misordering. To find out the percentage for each types of error, the researcher uses the formula as follows:

$$\text{Error Percentage (\%)} = \frac{\text{(The Number of Errors at Each Category)}}{\text{(The Total Number of Errors)}} \times 100\%$$

### *The Findings*

Having analyzed the data, the findings can be seen as follows:

**Table 4.1 Types of Errors in Translating Narrative Text Made by the Second- Year Students of SMA Tunas Pelita Binjai**

No	Types of Errors	Accuracy		
		Frequency	Percentage	
1	Omission	Content Morphemes	52	22,61
		Grammatical Morphemes	-	-
2	Addition	26	11,30	
3	Misformation	150	65,22	
4	Misordering	2	0,87	

Based on the table, the researcher found four types of error in translating narrative text, namely; omission, addition, misformation, and misordering. For omission error, the researcher only found one type error, it was omission of content morpheme, it happened because the omission error of grammatical morpheme that the students made only consisted of article omitting, like 'a' and 'the', or to be 'was' and 'were' which didn't carry much meaning, so it didn't change the meaning of the target language Bahasa Indonesia. The result of grammatical morphemes errors was still in accordance with Ejaan yang Disempunakan (EYD) and Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia (KBBI). 'The table also showed that misformation was the most dominant error that was found in the students' translating text with 150 occurrences, or 65,22%

## **CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS**

### ***The Conclusions***

1. From the findings have been described previously, conclusions can be drawn as follows: (1) the researcher found 230 errors in students' translation text, and it consists of Dulay's Surface Strategy Taxonomy types of error; omission, addition, misformation, and misordering, the types of errors that found in students' translation texts are omission errors with 52 occurrences (22,61%), addition errors with 26 occurrences (11,30%), misformation errors with 150 occurrences (65,22%), and misordering errors with 2 occurrences (0,87%), and the most dominant error is misformation error, (2) the causes of the

students' errors in translating narrative text are influenced by the interlingual and intralingual transfer. Interlingual transfer is caused by the interference from mother language, Bahasa Indonesia. For example, a student who has not known the rules of the foreign language will use the same rules as he obtained in his native language. Intralingual transfer happens because the learners' attempt to build up concept and hypotheses about the target language from their limited experience with it. In other words, the errors appear because of the students' lack of knowledge in forming a well- formed utterance and their limited knowledge about English vocabulary.

### *The Suggestions*

Considering the conclusions above, some suggestions are presented in this part, for teacher: (1) for teachers, teachers must correct the students' errors on their assignment then return them back to the students then discuss again with them to avoid making errors in the next task. In addition, teachers must find the suitable strategy in teaching translation so the students can convey the meaning and it will help students master other skill, such as writing or mastering vocabulary, (2) for students, students must be more aware in translating texts; they must pay more attention when learning English and avoid repeating the same errors, and (3) for further research, the researcher hopes that in the future, there will be another research that develops this research and improve the students' translation skill.

## REFERENCES

- Ary, D. et al. (2002). *Introduction to Research in Education*. Stanford: Wadsworth/Thomson Learning
- Bell, R., T. (1991). *Translation and Translating: Theory and Practice*. London: Longman
- Brown, H. (2000). *Principles of Language Learning and Teaching* (4<sup>th</sup> ed.). New Jersey: Prentice-Hall Inc.
- Brown, H. (2001). *Teaching by Principles: An Interactive Approach Language Pedagogy* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). San Francisco: Addison Wesley Longman, Inc.
- Crystal, David. (2008). *A Dictionary of Linguistics and Phonetics*. Colorado: Westview Press
- Crystal, D. (2003). *English as a Global Language*. United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press
- Dulay, H. et al. (1982). *Language Two*. Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Elmgrab, R., A. (2013). Evaluation of Translation Errors: Procedures and Criteria. 62(13).doi:10.7763/IPEDR
- Fraenkel & Wallen. (2009). *How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education*. New York: The McGraw-Hill Companies
- Gass, S.M. and Selinker, L. (2000). *Second Language Acquisition: An Introductory Course*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates
- Shuttleworth, M., & Cowie, M. (2014). *Dictionary of Translation Studies*. London and New York: Routledge
- Siahaan, S., & Shinoda, K. (2008). *Generic Text Structure*. Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu